Turbulence Modelling

B. Dubrulle CNRS SPEC, CEA Saclay

Astrophysical Flows



Control Parameter:







 $Re = 10^2$

 $Re = 10^{7}$





 $Re = 10^{12}$



 $Re = 10^{21}$

Laboratory Flows



Von Karman Re $= 10^{6}$ Taylor-Couette $Re = 10^5$

 $Re = 10^{3}$

Similarity Principle:same boundray conditions, same Reynolds->same behaviour





Application of 772.24 foot pound force (4.1550 J.cal-1) results in elevation of temperature of a pound of water by one degree Fahrenheit

> Fluid good converters of **Mechanical enery** into heat

Aside about Joule's experiment





NEQFLUIDS2016: Classical and Quantum Fluids Out of Equilibrium 13-16 Jul 2016 Grand Hotel de Paris, Villard de Lans (France)

Robert&Collins

Lessiveuse: n.m. Traduction: washing machine

Ils utilisent le club de cartes comme leur lessiveuse. ->They use the card club as their washing machine.

Aside about Joule's experiment





1840 Robert&Collins

1991

Von Karman Flow: n.m. Traduction: french washing machine

They use their french washing machine as experimental set up-> Ils utilisent leur lessiveuse comme experience.

Douady S, Couder Y and Brachet M E 1991 Direct observation of the intermittency of intense vorticity filaments in turbulence Phys. Rev. Lett. 67 983

A modern version: VK flow





Work measured by Torques applied at Shafts Heat flux measured By keeping T constant

Rousset et al, RSI 85, 103908 (2014);

Zeroth law of turbulence



Non-dimensional Energy dissipation per unit mass is independent of viscosity!!!!!

Ravelet PhD, Saint-Michel PhD, VKS collaboration, SHREK collaboration

Observation: power-law spectrum



Saclay team: Debue, Kuzzay, Faranda, Saw, Daviaud, Dubrulle et al, (2016)

Observation of Fluid Movements



Creation of structures finer and finer till dissipation by viscosity-> scale hierachy

Scale hierarchy





Scale hierarchy



Leonard de Vinci

Richardson's Cascade

So, nat'ralists observe, a flea Hath smaller fleas that on him prey, And these have smaller yet to bite 'em, And so proceed ad infinitum. Thus every poet, in his kind, Is bit by him that comes behind.

(Jonathan Swift)



Big whirls have little whirls, Which feed on their velocity, And little whirls have lesser whirls And so on to viscosity." Lewis Fry Richardson 1881-1953



Kolmogorov Cascade (1941)

Big whirls have little whirls, Which feed on their velocity, And little whirls have lesser whirls, And so on to viscosity."



Lewis Fry Richardson

Andrey Kolmogorov 1903-1987

Kolmogorov Theory (1)

NSE+homogeneity



$$\frac{1}{2}\partial_{t}\left\langle \left(\delta u_{\ell}\right)^{2}\right\rangle + \varepsilon = -\frac{1}{4}\nabla_{\ell}\left\langle \left(\delta u_{\ell}\right)^{3}\right\rangle + \nu\Delta_{\ell}\left\langle \left(\delta u_{\ell}\right)^{2}\right\rangle$$
$$\delta u_{\ell} = u(x+\ell) - u(x)$$

Karman Howarth equation

Kolmogorov Theory (2)

KH equation + self-similarity+stationarity



Interpretation: The energy cascade



Turbulence phenomenology

Robust result Kolmogorov spectrum

Interpretation (Kolmogorov 1941) Energy cascade



Constant energy transfer

$$\frac{du^2}{dt} = \varepsilon \approx \frac{u^3}{l} = cte$$
$$\Rightarrow u \propto (\varepsilon l)^{\frac{1}{3}}$$

Degrees of freedom
$$N = \left(\frac{L}{\eta}\right)^3 \propto \text{Re}^{\frac{\eta}{4}}$$

The scales of turbulence



L

Example: the sun

14 June 1994: Con	tinuum Intensity		
Dissipation scale	peale/Lookheed (P. Brendt, G. Simon, G. Scher Granule	nor, D. Shiro) HAO Solar spot	Giant Convective cell
0.1 km	$10^3 km$	$3\cdot 10^4$ km	$2 \cdot 10^5 km$
	$N = (10^6)^3 = 10^1$	8	

Many degrees of freedom!

Scale of turbulence





L=10m η=0.06mm

L=6000 km η=6mm

We have the basic equations... Can we simulate all these systeme?

$$\vec{\nabla} \cdot \vec{u} = \vec{0}$$

$$\vec{\partial}_t \vec{u} + (\vec{u} \cdot \vec{\nabla})\vec{u} = -\frac{1}{\rho}\vec{\nabla}p + \nu\Delta\vec{u}$$



Computer Blue Gene

Simulation:

6 10⁹ nodes --> 1 week of CPU on Blue Gene



Storage: 10⁸ nodes- -> 2Tb= 1 disk



L=10m

η=0.06mm

$$N = \left(\frac{L}{\eta}\right)^3$$

 $N=10^{5}$

$$N=10^{16}$$

$$N=10^{27}$$

km η=6mm

L=6000

L=5cm η=1mm

L=10m

L=6000

η=6mm

km

η=0.06mm

1 mn of cpu Less than a disk

```
N=10^{16}
```

 $N=10^{27}$

L=5cm η=1mm

L=10m

L=6000

η=6mm

km

η=0.06mm

1 mn of cpu Lett than a disk

20 000 years of cpu 100 billions disks

 $N=10^{27}$

L=5cm η=1mm

L=10m

L=6000

η=6mm

km

η=0.06mm

1 mn of cpu Less than a disk

20 000 years of cpu 100 billions disks

10¹⁵ years of cpu 10¹⁹ disks

1 mn of cpu Less than a disk



L=5cm

η=1mm

20 000 years of cpu 100 billions disks

10¹⁵ years of cpu 10¹⁹ disks

What can be done?



Building on Kolmogorov

 $\frac{1}{2}\partial_{t}\left\langle \left(\delta u_{\ell}\right)^{2}\right\rangle + \varepsilon = -\frac{1}{4}\nabla_{\ell}\left\langle \left(\delta u_{\ell}\right)^{3}\right\rangle + \nu\Delta_{\ell}\left\langle \left(\delta u_{\ell}\right)^{2}\right\rangle$

Energy injection

Energy transfer

Viscous dissipation

$$\frac{1}{2}\partial_t \left\langle \left(\delta u_\ell\right)^2 \right\rangle + \varepsilon = \nabla_\ell (v_T \nabla_\ell \left\langle \left(\delta u_\ell\right)^2 \right\rangle) + v \Delta_\ell \left\langle \left(\delta u_\ell\right)^2 \right\rangle$$

Turbulent Viscosity

What can be done?



Two ways to cut the scale space



Large scale

Mathematical translation

$$\partial_{t}u_{i} + u_{j}\nabla_{j}u_{i} = -\nabla_{i}p + \frac{1}{\text{Re}}\Delta u_{i} + f_{i}$$

$$u = \overline{u} + u' \qquad - \text{Spatial filter for LES} - \text{Ensemble average for RANS}$$

$$\partial_{t}\overline{u}_{i} + \overline{u}_{j}\nabla_{j}\overline{u}_{i} = -\nabla_{i}\overline{p} + \frac{1}{\text{Re}}\Delta\overline{u}_{i} + \overline{f}_{i} - \nabla_{j}\tau_{ij}$$
Reynolds stress
$$\tau_{ij} = \overline{u}_{i}\overline{u}_{j} - \overline{u}_{i}\overline{u}_{j} + \overline{u}_{i}u'_{j} + \overline{u'}_{i}\overline{u}_{j} + \overline{u'}_{i}u'_{j}$$
LES
$$\tau_{ij} = +\overline{u'}_{i}u'_{j}$$
RANS

Influence of decimated scales

Typical time at scale 1:

$$\delta t \approx \frac{l}{u} \propto l^{2/3}$$

Decimated scales (small scales) vary very rapidly We may replace them by a noise with short time scale

$$u = \overline{u} + u'$$

$$D_{t}u'_{i} = A_{ij}u'_{j} + \xi_{j}$$

$$\left\langle \xi_{i}(x,t)\xi_{j}(x',t')\right\rangle = \kappa_{ij}(x,x')\delta(t-t')$$

Generalized Langevin equation

Obukhov Model

Simplest case

$$\begin{aligned} \overline{u} &= 0 \\ A_{ij} &= -\gamma \delta_{ij}, \quad \gamma >> \delta t \\ \kappa_{ij}(x, x') &\propto \gamma \delta_{ij} \end{aligned}$$

No mean flow

Large isotropic friction No spatial correlations

$$P(\vec{x}, \vec{u}, t) = \left(\frac{\sqrt{3}}{2\pi\varepsilon t^2}\right) \exp\left(-\frac{3x^2}{\varepsilon t^3} - \frac{3\vec{x}\cdot\vec{u}}{\varepsilon t^2} - \frac{u^2}{\varepsilon t}\right)$$

 $u \propto \sqrt{\epsilon t}$ Gaussian velocities $x \propto \epsilon^{2/3} t^{3/2}$ Richardson's law $u \propto x^{1/3}$ Kolmogorov's spectra



LES: Langevin

Influence of decimated scales: transport

$$\vec{x} = \vec{u} + \vec{u}'$$

$$\vec{\Omega} = \vec{\nabla} \times \vec{u}$$

$$\vec{\Omega} = (\vec{\Omega} \cdot \vec{\nabla})\vec{u} + (\vec{\Omega} \cdot \vec{\nabla})\vec{u}'$$
Stochastic computation
$$\beta_{kl} = \langle u_k' u_l' \rangle$$

$$\alpha_{ijk} = \langle u_i' \partial_k u_j' \rangle$$

$$\partial_t \overline{\Omega_i} + \overline{u}_k \nabla_k \overline{\Omega_i} = \overline{\Omega_k} \nabla_k \overline{u_i} + \nabla_k [\beta_{kl} \nabla_l \overline{\Omega_i}] + 2\alpha_{kil} \nabla_k \overline{\Omega_l}$$

Turbulent viscosity AKA effect

Parametrization: RANS

Issue: Reynolds stress parametrization

 $\tau_{ij} = +\overline{u'_{i} u'_{j}}$ $= -\alpha_{ijk}\overline{u_{k}} - \beta_{ijkl}\nabla_{k}\overline{u_{l}}$

AKA effect	Turbulent Viscosity	
Helicity effect	4 order tensor	
Influence on mean flow (breaks Galilean invariance)	Can be « negative » (instabilities)	
Produces large scale-instabilities		
(cf dynamo effect)		
Sulem, Frisch, She	Dubrulle&Frisch	RANS

Parametrization: RANS AKA effect

Use to explain:

Solar Granulation (Kishan, MNRAS, 1991)

Galaxy Clustering (Kishan, MNRAS, 1993)

Large-scale vortices in disks (Kitchatinov et al, A&A, 1994)

Liitle (not?) used in general turbulence

No general theory

Analogy with dynamo:

$$\alpha_{ijk} = \frac{1}{3} \frac{\vec{u} \cdot (\nabla \times \vec{u})}{\tau} \varepsilon_{ijk}$$

3D isotropic
RANS: AKA

Parametrization: RANS Viscosity

Not necessarily isotrop(cf shear flows) (Dubrulle&Frisch,

Isotropic Case
$$\beta_{ijkl} = v_T \delta_{jk} \delta_{il}$$

Dimensional analysis $v_T = KVL$
Constant Characteristic
Characteristic
Characteristic
velocity
Kolmogorov theory $V = (\varepsilon L)^{\frac{1}{3}}$

RANS: Viscosity



Example 2: Smagorinski

Viscosity written function of mean gradients



RANS: Viscosity

Example 3: RNG

Viscosity in spectral space

$$v_T \Delta \overline{u}_i \rightarrow -\hat{v}_T k^2 \overline{\hat{u}_i}$$



Computed with renormalization group

RANS: Viscosity

Multi-scale computation





Main idea: use scale separation

Method: a) Linearization equations b) development of operators and fields in power of *E*c) Solve order by order d) Solvability conditions provide coefficient

Example: Turbulent diffusivity

Frisch in « Lecture notes on turbulence » World Scientific, 1989

Before we start...

Is there a solution to ? Ax = y

Solvability condition: $y \in \text{Im}(A) \Leftrightarrow \forall z \in Ker(A^+), y \bullet z = 0$

In space of periodical functions

$$f \bullet g = \int f(x,t)g(x,t)dxdt$$
$$Ker(A^+) = 1: x \to 1$$

RANS: multi

Solvability condition $1 \cdot y = \langle y \rangle = \int y(x) dx = 0$

Turbulent diffusion (1)

Basic equation: passive scalar

$$\partial_T \Theta + \vec{u} \bullet \nabla_x \Theta = \kappa \nabla_x^2 \Theta$$
$$\left\langle \vec{u} \right\rangle = \vec{0}$$

Fast variables: X tSlow variables $X = \varepsilon x$ $T = \varepsilon^{2} t$

expansion

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_x &\leftarrow \nabla_x + \varepsilon \nabla_X \\ \partial_t &\leftarrow \partial_t + \varepsilon^2 \partial_T \\ \Theta(x, X, t, T) &= \Theta^{(0)} + \varepsilon \Theta^{(1)} + \varepsilon^2 \Theta^{(2)} + \dots \end{aligned}$$

Frisch in « Lecture notes on turbulence » World Scientific, 1989



Turbulent diffusion (3)

Equation

$$\begin{aligned}
& \Theta^{(2)} + \vec{u} \nabla_x \Theta^{(2)} + \partial_T \left\langle \Theta^{(0)} \right\rangle = \\
& -\vec{u} \nabla_X \Theta^{(1)} + \kappa \nabla_x^2 \Theta^{(2)} + \kappa \nabla_x^2 \left\langle \Theta^{(0)} \right\rangle \\
& + 2\kappa \nabla_x \nabla_x \Theta^{(1)} \\
& \text{Solvability} \qquad \partial_T \left\langle \Theta^{(0)} \right\rangle = \left(\kappa \nabla_x^2 + D_{ij} \partial_{X_i} \partial_{X_j} \right) \left\langle \Theta^{(0)} \right\rangle \\
& \text{Turbulent Diffusivity} \qquad D_{ij} = -\frac{1}{2} \left[\left\langle u_i \chi_j \right\rangle + \left\langle u_j \chi_i \right\rangle \right] \\
& = \kappa \left\langle \partial_i \chi_i \partial_i \chi_i \right\rangle > 0
\end{aligned}$$

Frisch in « Lecture notes on turbulence » World Scientific, 1989-

Two ways to cut the scale space



Large scale

Mathematical translation

$$\partial_{t}u_{i} + u_{j}\nabla_{j}u_{i} = -\nabla_{i}p + \frac{1}{\text{Re}}\Delta u_{i} + f_{i}$$

$$u = \overline{u} + u' \qquad - \text{Spatial filter for LES} - \text{Ensemble average for RANS}$$

$$\partial_{t}\overline{u}_{i} + \overline{u}_{j}\nabla_{j}\overline{u}_{i} = -\nabla_{i}\overline{p} + \frac{1}{\text{Re}}\Delta\overline{u}_{i} + \overline{f}_{i} - \nabla_{j}\tau_{ij}$$
Reynolds stress
$$\tau_{ij} = \overline{u}_{i}\overline{u}_{j} - \overline{u}_{i}\overline{u}_{j} + \overline{u}_{i}u'_{j} + \overline{u'}_{i}\overline{u}_{j} + \overline{u'}_{i}u'_{j}$$
LES
$$\tau_{ij} = +\overline{u'}_{i}u'_{j}$$
RANS

Parametrization: LES Filters

$$\overline{f(x)} = \int f(x') G(x - x') dx' \Leftrightarrow \hat{\overline{f}}(k) = \hat{f}(k) \hat{G}(k)$$



Parametrization: LES



Issue: Reynolds stress parametrization

Parametrization: LES Global models



Lesieur, « Turbulence in Fluids », Kluwer, 1990

Parametrization: LES Gradient Model

$$\tau_{ij} = C \left(\Delta x \right)^2 \overline{S_{ik}} \overline{S_{jk}}$$

C= adjustable constant





Calibration of C using angular momentum conservation



Kuzzay, Faranda and B. Dubrulle, Phys Fluids (2015)



Kuzzay, Faranda and B. Dubrulle, Phys Fluids (2015)

Check LES vs Experiment



Why planes do flight...

$$\frac{1}{2}\partial_t \left\langle \left(\delta u_\ell\right)^2 \right\rangle + \varepsilon = \nabla_\ell (v_T \nabla_\ell \left\langle \left(\delta u_\ell\right)^2 \right\rangle) + v \Delta_\ell \left\langle \left(\delta u_\ell\right)^2 \right\rangle$$

Kolmogorov Idea:

$$\boldsymbol{v}_T = F(\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}, \ell, \delta u_\ell^2)$$

On dimensional ground

$$\boldsymbol{v}_T = \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}^{\alpha} \left(\delta \boldsymbol{u}_{\ell}^2 \right)^{(1-3\alpha)/2} \ell^{1+\alpha}$$

Mixing length, smagorinski: $\alpha = 1/3$ Gradient Model: $\alpha = 0$

Why planes do flight...

One scale integration:

$$\varepsilon \frac{\ell}{d} = (v_T + v) \nabla_\ell \left\langle \left(\delta u_\ell \right)^2 \right\rangle$$

Two scale integration:

$$\frac{\left(\varepsilon\ell\right)^{1-\alpha}}{d\left(1-\alpha\right)} = K\left\langle \left(\delta u_{\ell}\right)^{2}\right\rangle^{3(1-\alpha)/2}$$

So except if you take alpha=1, you get Kolmogorov spectrum!!!

But burners do not burn....

Kolmogorov self-similarity

$$\delta u_{l} = u(x+l) - u(x) \propto l^{1/3}$$
$$\left\langle \delta u_{l}^{n} \right\rangle \propto l^{n/3}$$
$$\delta u P(\delta u, l) = F\left(\frac{\delta u}{l^{3/3}}\right)$$







Frisch Turbulence, Cambridge University Press 1991

References

Lesieur, « Turbulence in Fluids », Kluwer, 1990 Frisch Turbulence, Cambridge University Press 1991 Frisch in « Lecture notes on turbulence » World Scientific, 1989 Dubrulle & Frisch, Phys. Rev A, vol 43, p5355 (1991)

J-P. Laval, B. Dubrulle and S. Nazarenko, Phys. Fluid 13 1995-2012 (2001).

B. Dubrulle, J-P. Laval, S. Nazarenko and O. Zaboronski, J. Fluid Mech. 520 1-21 (2004)

J-P. Laval , B. Dubrulle and J.C. McWilliams , Phys. Fluids 15 (5) : 1327-1339 (2003)

J-P. Laval and B. Dubrulle, Eur. Phys. J B 49 471-481 (2006).

G. Parisi, U. Frisch in Turbulence and Predictability in Geophysical Fluid Dynamics, Proceed. Intern. School. of Physics "E. Fermi". eds. Ghil M, Benzi R, Parisi G. (1985) 84.